

**HAIL: A REVIEW OF HAIL SCIENCE AND
HAIL SUPPRESSION**

Edited by

G. Brant Foote and Charles A. Knight

Published by the American Meteorological Society

METEOROLOGICAL MONOGRAPHS

VOLUME 16

DECEMBER 1977

NUMBER 38

**HAIL:
A REVIEW OF HAIL SCIENCE AND
HAIL SUPPRESSION**

by

**Stewart W. Borland, K. A. Browning, Stanley A. Changnon, Jr., William A. Cooper,
Edwin F. Danielsen, A. S. Dennis, Bruno Federer, John A. Flueck, G. Brant Foote,
Guy G. Goyer, W. F. Hitschfeld, A. R. Jameson, Roland List, W. C. Macklin,
John D. Marwitz, J. B. Maxwell, J. A. McGinley, Paul W. Mielke, Jr., R. C. Miller,
Griffith M. Morgan, Jr., T. R. Nicholas, Harold D. Orville, J. H. Renick, R. C. Srivastava,
Gabor Vali, Donald L. Veal, Kenneth C. Young**

Edited by

G. Brant Foote and Charles A. Knight

**A Memorial Volume Dedicated to
Frank Henry Ludlam**

Published by the American Meteorological Society
45 Beacon St., Boston, Mass. 02108

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INSTITUT 101/2330
 FÜR METEOROLOGIE U. KLIMATOLOGIE
 DER TECHN. UNIVERSITÄT
 MANNOVER • HERRENHAUSER STR. 2

Preface

—G. B. FOOTE AND C. A. KNIGHT

In Memory of Frank Henry Ludlam

—K. A. BROWNING

PART I: HAIL PHYSICS

The Structure and Mechanisms of Hailstorms

—K. A. BROWNING

.....	1
ABSTRACT	1
1. Classification of hailstorms	1
<i>a. A primary classification</i>	1
<i>b. A secondary classification</i>	2
<i>c. The concept of the steady-state supercell</i>	2
<i>d. Environmental factors responsible for different storm types</i>	3
2. Visual appearance of hail clouds	4
<i>a. Daughter clouds and feeder clouds</i>	4
<i>b. Large cloud domes</i>	5
<i>c. Large anvil plumes</i>	6
<i>d. The form of the cloud base</i>	6
3. Radar structure of hailstorms	6
<i>a. The radar vault and weak-echo regions</i>	6
<i>b. Radar structure of ordinary multicell storms</i>	8
<i>c. Radar structure of supercell storms</i>	9
4. Airflow in and near hailstorms	10
<i>a. Location of the updraft</i>	10
<i>b. Inflow toward the updraft</i>	11
<i>c. Vertical velocity in the updraft</i>	13
<i>d. Tilt of the updraft</i>	15
<i>e. Dimensions of the updraft</i>	17
<i>f. Turbulence and mixing in the updraft</i>	18
<i>g. The updraft as an obstacle to environmental flow</i>	19
<i>h. Rotation within the updraft</i>	19
<i>i. Some properties of the downdraft</i>	20
5. Nature and distribution of the precipitation within hailstorms	21
<i>a. General features</i>	21
<i>b. Particle size distributions aloft</i>	24
<i>c. The accumulation zone: fact or fiction?</i>	25
6. A model of the airflow and hail growth in an ordinary multicell storm	26
<i>a. Airflow and storm structure</i>	27
<i>b. Hail growth and trajectories</i>	27
7. A model of the airflow and hail growth in a unicellular supercell storm	29
<i>a. Airflow and storm structure</i>	29
<i>b. Hail growth and trajectories</i>	31
8. Some important concepts related to hail growth	34
<i>a. Precipitation efficiency and depletion</i>	34
<i>b. Beneficial competition and unfair competition</i>	34
<i>c. Recycling of precipitation and some further thoughts on hailstorm classification:</i> <i>vaulted and unvaulted supercells</i>	36

9. Recommendations for further research	38
REFERENCES	39
 Response to "The Structure and Mechanisms of Hailstorms"	
—G. BRANT FOOTE	45
1. General remarks	45
2. Confidence in the models	45
3. Hail embryos	45
4. Storm types	46
5. Conclusions	47
REFERENCES	47
 A Review of Hailstone-Hailstorm Numerical Simulations	
—HAROLD D. ORVILLE	49
ABSTRACT	49
1. Introduction	49
2. Wet and dry growth and spongy growth of hailstones	50
3. Background studies—uncoupled microphysics-dynamics models	50
<i>a. Steady-state flow models</i>	50
<i>b. Time-dependent flow models</i>	52
4. Coupled microphysics-dynamics studies	52
<i>a. Steady-state, single parcel flow models</i>	52
<i>b. Fully interacting, time-dependent models</i>	53
5. A summary of primary results	55
6. Problems and prospects	56
<i>a. Numerical problems</i>	56
<i>b. Dynamic problems</i>	57
<i>c. Microphysical problems</i>	58
<i>d. Prospects</i>	60
REFERENCES	60
 Response to "A Review of Hailstone-Hailstorm Numerical Simulations"	
—GRIFFITH M. MORGAN, JR.	63
REFERENCES	64
 The Characteristics of Natural Hailstones and Their Interpretation	
—W. C. MACKLIN	65
ABSTRACT	65
1. Introduction	65
2. Theory	65
<i>a. The growth equations</i>	65
<i>b. The heat balance equation</i>	66
3. Characteristics of hailstones	67
<i>a. Shape and size</i>	67
<i>b. Embryos</i>	68
<i>c. Layer structure</i>	70

<i>d. Lobe structure</i>	71
<i>e. Isotopic composition</i>	73
<i>f. Particulate content</i>	73
4. Aerodynamic behavior	74
5. The growth parameters	75
<i>a. Density</i>	75
<i>b. Collection efficiency</i>	75
<i>c. The drag coefficient</i>	76
<i>d. Heat transfer coefficient</i>	76
6. Methods of analysis	76
<i>a. Isotopic composition</i>	76
<i>b. Crystal structure</i>	78
<i>c. Air bubble structure</i>	80
7. Interpretation of hailstone structure	82
8. Concluding remarks	86
REFERENCES	86

**Response to “The Characteristics of Natural Hailstones and Their Interpretation”:
Laboratory Hail Research—A Critical Assessment**

—ROLAND LIST	89
1. Introduction	89
2. The interpretation of hailstone interpretation	89
3. Microphysical-dynamic feedback in hail modelling	90
4. The rain-hail connection	90
5. Final comments	91
REFERENCES	91

Freezing Nucleus Content of Hail and Rain in NE Colorado

—GABOR VALI	93
ABSTRACT	93
1. Introduction	93
2. Methods	94
<i>a. Observational site</i>	94
<i>b. Sample collection</i>	94
<i>c. Analysis</i>	95
3. Results	96
<i>a. Overview</i>	96
<i>b. Nucleus spectra</i>	98
<i>c. Rain-rate dependence</i>	98
<i>d. Hail-rain comparisons</i>	99
<i>e. Hailstone analysis</i>	100
<i>f. Altitude dependence</i>	101
<i>g. Sizes of nuclei</i>	102
<i>h. Particulate content</i>	102
4. Discussion	103
REFERENCES	104

The Climatology of Hail in North America	
—STANLEY A. CHANGNON, JR.	107
ABSTRACT	107
1. Introduction	107
2. History of hail research	107
3. Data	108
<i>a. Weather Service data</i>	109
<i>b. Hail insurance data</i>	109
<i>c. Special mesonetwork data</i>	109
4. National scale studies	110
<i>a. Spatial findings</i>	110
<i>b. Temporal findings</i>	113
5. Regional-scale studies	114
<i>a. Regions of study</i>	114
<i>b. Spatial findings</i>	114
<i>c. Temporal findings</i>	115
<i>d. Hail and associated weather</i>	117
<i>e. Economic aspects</i>	117
6. Small-area studies	118
<i>a. Spatial findings</i>	119
<i>b. Temporal findings</i>	123
<i>c. Hail and other conditions</i>	124
7. Summary and recommendations	125
REFERENCES	126
Response to "The Climatology of Hail in North America"	
—GUY G. GOYER	129
1. Introduction	129
2. Fine-scale structure of hailswaths	129
3. The significance of hailcores	132
4. Conclusions	132
REFERENCES	133
Inherent Difficulties in Hail Probability Prediction	
—EDWIN F. DANIELSEN	135
ABSTRACT	135
1. Introduction	135
2. Some necessary and sufficient conditions	135
3. Possible microphysical-dynamical feedbacks	137
4. Limitations of prediction models	138
5. Conclusions drawn from more general models	140
REFERENCES	142
Forecasting Hailfall in Alberta	
—J. H. RENICK AND J. B. MAXWELL	145
ABSTRACT	145
1. Introduction	145
2. Hail forecasting	145

3. Forecasting procedures	148
4. Summary	150
REFERENCES	151

**Response to “Inherent Difficulties in Hail Probability Prediction”
and “Forecasting Hailfall in Alberta”**

—R. C. MILLER AND J. A. MCGINLEY	153
--	-----

REFERENCES	154
------------------	-----

PART II: HAIL SUPPRESSION

Hail Suppression: Progress in Assessing Its Costs and Benefits

—STEWART W. BORLAND	155
---------------------------	-----

ABSTRACT	155
----------------	-----

1. Introduction	155
2. Early work (1942–1969)	156
3. Estimation of direct benefits	159
<i>a. Using insurance data</i>	159
<i>b. The land-value approach</i>	160
<i>c. Crop damage function studies</i>	161
<i>d. Reduction of property damage</i>	163
4. Program costs, scale and structure	163
5. Secondary and indirect effects	165
<i>a. Ecological impacts</i>	165
<i>b. Regional economic shifts</i>	166
<i>c. Extra-area influences</i>	167
6. Social impacts and responses	168
7. Legal and institutional adjustments	170
8. Current work	172
<i>a. The contemporary approach</i>	172
<i>b. Studies underway and planned</i>	172
9. Unexplored issues	173
REFERENCES	174

Response to “Hail Suppression: Progress in Assessing Its Costs and Benefits”

—STANLEY A. CHANGNON, JR.	177
--------------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	177
2. Review of key issues	177
3. Minor problems	178
4. Important unknowns and unexplored issues	178
REFERENCES	179

Hail Suppression Concepts and Seeding Methods

—A. S. DENNIS	181
---------------------	-----

ABSTRACT	181
----------------	-----

1. Conceptual models of hail suppression	181
2. Seeding methods	181
<i>a. Broadcast seeding</i>	182
<i>b. Updraft seeding</i>	182

<i>c. Direct injection</i>	182
<i>d. Comparison of methods</i>	182
3. Experimental results	182
<i>a. Broadcast seeding</i>	183
<i>b. Updraft seeding</i>	183
<i>c. Direct injection</i>	184
<i>d. Dynamic effects</i>	184
<i>e. Summary</i>	185
4. Attempts to model hail suppression processes	185
<i>a. Rationale for modeling</i>	185
<i>b. Modeling of nucleation processes</i>	185
<i>c. Models of cloud glaciation concept</i>	185
<i>d. Competing embryo concept</i>	186
<i>e. Implications for field projects</i>	189
5. Summary and conclusions	189
REFERENCES	190

Response to "Hail Suppression Concepts and Seeding Methods"

—W. F. HITSCHFELD	193
-------------------------	-----

A Numerical Examination of Some Hail Suppression Concepts

—KENNETH C. YOUNG	195
-------------------------	-----

ABSTRACT	195
1. Introduction	195
2. A conceptual model of hail formation and growth	195
3. The glaciation concept	196
<i>a. Discussion of the model</i>	197
<i>b. Evaluation of the glaciation concept</i>	197
<i>c. Summary of the glaciation concept</i>	199
4. The beneficial competition concept	199
<i>a. Modification of the hail embryo spectrum</i>	200
<i>b. Competition in the hail growth zone</i>	203
<i>c. Discussion of the beneficial competition concept</i>	207
5. The trajectory lowering concept	208
<i>a. Discussion of the model</i>	209
<i>b. Growth of the seed embryos</i>	209
<i>c. Depletion of liquid water by the seed embryos</i>	209
<i>d. Summary of the trajectory lowering concept</i>	210
6. Summary of the concepts	212
<i>a. The glaciation concept</i>	212
<i>b. The beneficial competition concept</i>	212
<i>c. The trajectory lowering concept</i>	212
7. Discussion	213
REFERENCES	214

Methods and Results of Hail Suppression in Europe and in the USSR	
—BRUNO FEDERER	215
ABSTRACT	215
1. Introduction	215
2. Italy	215
3. France	216
4. Yugoslavia	218
5. Swiss randomized hail suppression experiment—Grossversuch IV	219
6. Soviet Union	221
<i>a. Seeding criteria</i>	221
<i>b. Safety of the rockets</i>	222
<i>c. Evaluation of the results</i>	222
REFERENCES	223

Design and Evaluation of Hail Suppression Experiments	
—JOHN A. FLUECK AND PAUL W. MIELKE, JR.	225
ABSTRACT	225
1. Prologue	225
2. What to do in the meantime	226
<i>a. Working models</i>	226
<i>b. Variables</i>	227
<i>c. Treatment design</i>	227
<i>d. Data management</i>	230
3. What to do between time	231
<i>a. Exploration</i>	232
<i>b. Confirmation</i>	233
4. Epilogue	233
REFERENCES	233

PART III: INSTRUMENTS

Some Aspects of Aircraft Instrumentation for Storm Research	
—DONALD L. VEAL, WILLIAM A. COOPER, GABOR VALI AND JOHN D. MARWITZ	237
ABSTRACT	237
1. Introduction	237
2. Aircraft location, velocity and attitude	238
<i>a. Observer reports</i>	238
<i>b. Aircraft velocity</i>	238
<i>c. Aircraft attitude</i>	239
3. Measurement of temperature, pressure and humidity	239
<i>a. Temperature</i>	239
<i>b. Humidity</i>	240
<i>c. Pressure</i>	241

4. Measurement of air motion	241
<i>a. Vertical velocities</i>	241
<i>b. Horizontal velocities</i>	242
5. Measurement of cloud physics parameters	243
<i>a. Cloud droplet sizes and concentrations</i>	243
<i>b. Liquid water content</i>	246
<i>c. Raindrop sizes and concentrations</i>	247
<i>d. Ice particle sizes and concentrations</i>	248
6. Operation of aircraft as effective research platforms in thunderstorm research: communications, data systems and radar	251
<i>a. Airborne data systems</i>	252
<i>b. Aircraft communications systems</i>	253
<i>c. Aircraft radar</i>	253
REFERENCES	253

A Review of Surface Hail Measurement

—T. R. NICHOLAS

ABSTRACT	257
1. Introduction	257
2. Measurement systems	257
<i>a. Observer reports</i>	257
<i>b. Hail chase</i>	258
<i>c. Hail samplers</i>	258
<i>d. Recording samplers</i>	258
<i>e. Hail instruments</i>	258
<i>f. Recording hail instruments</i>	261
<i>g. Other instruments</i>	264
3. Remote sensing of hail	265
<i>a. Radar reflectivity</i>	265
<i>b. Infrared radiometry</i>	265
4. Conclusions	265
REFERENCES	266

Radar Detection of Hail

—R. C. SRIVASTAVA AND A. R. JAMESON

ABSTRACT	269
1. Introduction	269
2. Hail detection: single-wavelength reflectivity	269
3. Hail detection: multi-wavelength reflectivity	269
4. Hail detection: Eccles-Atlas method	270
5. Inverted hail signal patterns	272
6. Measurement of reflectivity at attenuating wavelengths	274
7. Hail detection: polarization methods	275
8. Concluding remarks	277
REFERENCES	277